



Jakhongir IBRAGIMOV,
International Islamic Academy of Uzbekistan, independent researcher
E-mail: Jahonij1994@gmail.com

Based on the review by N. Ubaydullayev, PhD in psychology, 1st vice-rector's advisor of Oriental University

MIRRORS FOR PRINCES: COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVES FROM THE ISLAMIC EAST AND CHRISTIAN WEST

Annotation

Article scrutinizes the evolution and impact of the “mirrors for princes” genre in both the Islamic East and Christian West through a detailed examination of key texts, such as Al-Farabi’s “The Virtuous City” and Machiavelli’s “The Prince”. By making comparative analysis the article highlights both the analogies and disparities in the ways of coping with management, moral principles and the obligations of governors. The results of the study demonstrate that while each institution prioritized rightfulness, morality and efficient administration, they diverged in their assimilation of few aspects like theological teachings, philosophy and governmental maneuvers. The work also highlights the importance of these resources in developing management styles and provides an understanding into how various traditions and religions have benefited to the formation of modern leadership and statecraft techniques.

Key words: Mirrors for princes, political philosophy, psychology of management, Islamic Renaissance, Medieval Europe, Al-Farabi, Machiavelli, justice, moral leadership, comparative analysis, political ethics, secularism, rulership, statecraft.

ЗЕРКАЛА ДЛЯ ПРИНЦЕВ: СРАВНИТЕЛЬНЫЕ ПЕРСПЕКТИВЫ ИСЛАМСКОГО ВОСТОКА И ХРИСТИАНСКОГО ЗАПАДА

Аннотация

В статье рассматривается эволюция и влияние жанра «зеркала для принцев» как на исламском Востоке, так и на христианском Западе посредством детального изучения ключевых текстов, таких как «Добродетельный город» Аль-Фараби и «Государь» Макиавелли. Путем сравнительного анализа в статье подчеркиваются как аналогии, так и различия в способах управления, моральных принципах и обязательствах правителей. Результаты исследования показывают, что, хотя каждое направление отдавало приоритет справедливости, морали и эффективному управлению, они расходились в усвоении нескольких аспектов, таких как теологические учения, философия и стратегия правления. Работа также подчеркивает важность этих ресурсов в развитии стилей управления и дает понимание того, как различные традиции и религии способствовали формированию современного лидерства и методов государственного управления.

Ключевые слова: Зеркала для принцев, политическая философия, психология управления, исламское Возрождение, средневековая Европа, Аль-Фараби, Макиавелли, справедливость, моральное лидерство, сравнительный анализ, политическая этика, светскость, правление, государственное управление.

SHAHZODALAR UCHUN KO'ZGU: ISLOM SHARQI VA XRISTIAN G'ARBINING QIYOSIY NUQTAI NAZARLARI

Annotatsiya

Maqolada “Shahzodalar uchun ko'zgu” janrining islom Sharqi va nasroniy G'arbidagi evolyutsiyasi va ta'siri Al-Farobiyning “Fozil odamlar shahri” va Makiavellining “Hukmdor” kabi asosiy matnlarni batafsil o'rganish orqali ko'rib chiqiladi. Maqolada qiyosiy tahlil qilish orqali G'arb va Sharq manbalarida boshqaruv, axloqiy tamoyillar va hokmdorlarning majburiyatlari kabi sohalarida kuzatiladigan o'xshashliklar va nomutanosibliklarga urg'u beriladi. Tadqiqot natijalari shuni ko'rsatadiki, har bir an'ana to'g'rilik, axloq va samarali boshqaruvni birinchi o'ringa qo'ygan bo'lsa-da, ular ilohiy ta'limotlar, falsafa va boshqaruv uslublari kabi bir nechta jihatlarini o'zlashtirishda turlicha yondashishgan. Ish, shuningdek, boshqaruv uslublarini rivojlantirishda ushbu resurslarning ahamiyatini ta'kidlaydi hamda turli an'ana va dinlarning zamonaviy liderlik va davlat boshqaruvi uslublarini shakllantirishga qanday foyda keltirganligi haqida tushuncha beradi.

Kalit so'zlar: Shahzodalar uchun ko'zgu, siyosiy falsafa, boshqaruv psixologiyasi, islom Uyg'onish davri, O'rta asrlar Yevropasi, Al-Farobiy, Makiavelli, adolat, moral liderlik, palataliya, axloq, dunyoviylik, hukmdorlik, davlat boshqaruvi.

Introduction. The term “Speculum principum” or “mirror for princes” refers to a genre which formed in ancient literature and got popularity in the Middle Ages and Renaissance. These works presented instructions on the strategies of governance, morality and the usage of authority and served as a code of conduct for rulers. The word speculum translates as “mirror” from Latin, illustrating the idea that these books would reflect a perfect image of a fair and righteous ruler for further imitation by the monarch [12]. The origin of the speculum principum genre can be linked back to classic antiquity, especially to the works and thoughts of Greek and Roman philosophers. As one of the most popular ancient illustrations, where authors analyzed the ethical duties of the leadership we can point to the Plato's “Republic” and Aristotle's “Politics”. Moreover, to the Cicero's “De Officiis”, where he underlined justness, wisdom, and the common good [4]. The other philosopher Seneca in his work written for Emperor Nero “De Clementia” emphasized the importance of mercy and justice.

These and the other early works demonstrated the relationship between morality and governance and served as a basis for later specula principum.

Literature review. The Middle Ages. During the Middle Ages Christian theology and the teachings of the Church shaped the speculum principum genre and stimulated its significant evolution. Authors from this period were aimed to create a complete ethical framework for rulers and therefore tried to combine Biblical principles with classical philosophy. Some of the remarkable texts from this period include St. Augustine's “De Civitate Dei”, John of Salisbury's “Policraticus” and Dante Alighieri's “De Monarchia”. For example St. Augustine's “De Civitate Dei” (The City of God) is not considered as a speculum principum in the proper sense, but it also impacted medieval political teachings by debating for the primacy of divine law over human law. Augustine accented that the members of the city of God must obey human laws as long as they do not militate against a higher loyalty, meaning to the God [5]. “Policraticus” which was written by John of Salisbury is often considered as the first

fully formed medieval *speculum principum*. Author, emphasizing king's moral responsibilities as God's servant, claims that a ruler should manifest virtues like wisdom, justice and restraint [9]. Dante Alighieri in his work "De Monarchia" provides theological and philosophical justifications for establishing universal monarchy as a way to achieve peace and justice in secular life, which closely corresponds with the objectives of the *speculum principum* [3].

The Renaissance. The Renaissance period demonstrated a shift toward humanism and a renewed interest in classical ancient literature. During this period the intellectual movement, which underlined human achievement potential and the application of classical ideals to the process of administration significantly changed the genre of mirrors for princes.

"Il Principe" (The Prince) by Niccolò Machiavelli arguably the most well-known piece of work in this genre. Machiavelli deviated from conventional moralistic approach and promoted practical occasionally brutal political strategies in order to attain stability and authority. Despite its controversy, The Prince is regarded as an important development of the genre that captured the nuanced political realities of Italy during the Renaissance [10].

Erasmus of Rotterdam in his "Institutio Principis Christiani" (The Education of a Christian Prince) in contrast to Machiavelli placed a strong emphasis on the role of Christian qualities like charity, humility and justice play in proper governance. Reflecting the Renaissance humanist synthesis of classical and Christian ideals, it maintained that a leader should rule with the well-being of his subjects in mind [2].

Islamic Renaissance. The "mirrors for princes" genre also found a parallel in the works of Muslim scientists who published treatises on political ethics, government and the moral obligations of rulers during the Islamic Renaissance, also known as the Islamic Golden Age (roughly VIII-XIV century). Through providing rulers with the advice on how to govern justly, prudently, and in line with Islamic values, these works significantly influenced thoughts on politics and ideal rules of management in the Islamic world.

For instance in his seminal book "Ara' Ahl al-Madina al-Fadila" (The Opinions of the Inhabitants of the Virtuous City), Al-Farabi also referred to as "The Second Teacher" (after Aristotle), depicts an ideal city run by a philosopher-king who exemplifies justice and wisdom. He assures that the leader must be morally and intellectually upright and should behave in conformity with the postulates of Islam and reasoning. The other virtue of the Al-Farabi's concepts is that he modified Plato's "Republic" to the Islamic world by fusing Islamic theology with Greek philosophy to offer a framework for just government [6].

Although Ibn Sina is best recognized as a physician and philosopher, his writings "Kitab al-Shifa" (The Book of Healing) and "Kitab al-Najat" (The Book of Deliverance) also made contributions to political and managerial theory. He addresses the function of rulers and the moral precepts of administration in his before mentioned books. He maintained that the ruler should be intelligent, guided by morally upright and wise in order to fulfill their duty to uphold justice and community's welfare. These texts provide rulers with ethical directions, even though they are not considered as proper example for the genre of mirrors for princes [1].

The other work named "Al-Ahkam al-Sultaniyya" (The Ordinances of Government) was written by jurist and political theorist Al-Mawardi as a guide for administrators and kings. These book offers a thorough manual on the obligations of the caliph and his representatives in providing justice and governing the state by the principles of Islam. Al-Mawardi's work is a basic text in the Islamic political tradition because it highlights the significance of justice, fairness and morality in leadership and government [7].

The "Siyasatnama" (The Book of Government) was penned by Nizam al-Mulk, a Persian vizier of the Seljuk Empire, as a useful manual for kings and officials, in which he covered topics like the difficulties of governing, the value of justice, the appropriate behavior of leaders and the administration of state. Relying on his vast experience as a statesman, author gives

helpful advices on upholding law and order, combating corruption, and guaranteeing the well-being of the populace. In the Islamic context, the Siyasatnama is regarded as one of the most important pieces in the mirrors for princes genre [11].

The most well-known contribution of historian, philosopher, and sociologist Ibn Khaldun is his seminal work "Muqaddimah" (Introduction), which offers a thorough examination of the emergence and decline of civilizations. He provides insights into the characteristics of successful leaders, the function of leadership in preserving societal cohesiveness and the significance of justice in governance. Ibn Khaldun's book is a unique addition to political and managerial thinking because, although it is less prescriptive than previous mirrors for princes, it provides a profound understanding of political dynamics, governance, and the cyclical nature of power [13].

In order to give leaders moral and ethical direction, renowned theologian, philosopher, and Sufi mystic Al-Ghazali composed "Nasihat al-Muluk" (Counsel for Kings). This treatise emphasizes leader's obligation to act justly, compassionally and humbly by fusing religious principles with useful guidance on governing. Al-Ghazali claims that a head of state should put the welfare of the populace first and serve as a role model for his folks. His writing is distinctive contribution to the genre science it synthesizes Sufi ethics, philosophy and Islamic jurisprudence [8].

Research methodology. Using the multidisciplinary approach, this comparative analysis of the "mirror for princes" genre looks at original materials from both Islamic and Western traditions to find recurrent motifs and distinctive viewpoints on governance and ruling. The research investigates the interaction of religious, philosophical and political aspects within each tradition by looking at these works in conjunction with secondary literature. The study also performs a thorough comparative analysis of the "mirror for princes" genre in both Islamic and Western traditions, highlighting the parallels and discrepancies between their views on usage of power, morality and government.

Analysis and results. Similarities. Ethical and moral guidance for leaders: Both traditions placed a strong emphasis on the ruler's responsibility to uphold justice and moral order in the state. Islamic scientists such as Al-Mawardi and Al-Ghazali similarly to their western counterparts like Erasmus and John of Salisbury stressed moral qualities like justice, fairness, and humility.

Integration of philosophical and religious ideas: Both institutions combined philosophy and religion to offer a holistic approach to governance. For example, Thomas Aquinas combined Christian theology with Aristotle's ideas on successful governance, while Al-Farabi blended Islamic thought with Platonic political theory.

Focus on justice as a central virtue: Representatives of both faiths view justice as divine requirement in addition to political necessity. According to Al-Mawardi and Nizam al-Mulk justice (adl) is believed to be ruler's primer responsibility and necessary to please the God. So the same can be seen in the works of John of Salisbury and Dante, where justice is depicted as the major duty and cornerstone of effective management.

Admonition against tyranny and abuse of power: Authors from both sides cautioned against tyranny and denounced leader who abuse their position of authority. Ibn Khaldun and Machiavelli claimed that tyranny would cause a threat to the state stability, when Al-Ghazali and Erasmus denounce autocratic rule as incompatible to the religious principles.

Differences. Approach to secularism and religion: Islamic writings usually were firmly based in theology and religious law (Sharia) when a notable difference is found in Machiavelli's "The Prince", which emphasized pragmatism and realpolitik over religious morality.

Philosophical foundations and sources: Islamic mirrors for princes drew upon a wide range of sources like Persian, Indian, and Greek philosophical traditions, when western authors were heavily influenced by classical Greco-Roman philosophers.

Function and character of the ruler: According to Islamic tradition, the ruler is characterized as the person who is in charge of enforcing moral behavior and putting Islamic law into practice, western renaissance authors approved unethical measures to

maintain stability of the state. Namely Machiavelli illustrated the ruler as the strategist, whose primary objective is preserving the

stability and authority of the state, even employing unethical measures when it's necessary.

Table 1. Comparative Analysis of «Mirror for Princes» in East and West

No	Category	Islamic East	Christian West	Comparison
1	Moral and Ethical Guidance	Emphasis on justice, humility	Emphasis on justice, compassion	Similarity
2	Integration of Religion & Philosophy	Islamic theology with Greek thought	Christian theology with classical thought	Similarity
3	Justice as a Central Virtue	Justice as divine mandate	Justice as foundation of governance	Similarity
4	Admonition Against Tyranny	Emphasis on ethical leadership	Warning against despotism	Similarity
5	Approach to Religion & Secularism	Governance rooted in Sharia law	Gradual secular approach	Difference
6	Philosophical Foundations & Sources	Based on Quran, Hadith, Greek philosophy	Based on Christian doctrine, Greco-Roman thought	Difference
7	Role and Nature of the Ruler	Ruler as religious and political figure	Ruler as pragmatic strategist	Difference

Conclusion. In conclusion we can state that the “mirrors for princes” of the Christian West and Islamic East differed in how they viewed religion, philosophical underpinnings and political power, but have similar themes such as such as the value of justice, the necessity of moral behavior and cautions against tyranny. Moreover, while Western texts, especially starting from the period of Renaissance, distinguished between political strategy

and religious morality, Islamic authors preserved the tendency to combine governance with religious teachings.

Taking everything into consideration it's clear that both traditions made substantial contributions to the growth of political philosophy and psychology of management, reflecting historical, religious and cultural backgrounds of their different societies and providing timeless perspectives on the principles of administration and leadership.

REFERENCES

1. Arioli, Daniel H. “The First Ruler and the Prophet: On the Identity-in-Difference of Politics, Religion, and Philosophy in the Thought of Alfarabi and Ibn Sina.” *Polity* 46, no. 4, 547–61, 2014.
2. Atienza, A. Ambrosio spínola: entre la cifra privada y el espionaje durante el reinado de felipe iii. *Studia Historica Historia Moderna*, 41(2), 221, 2019.
3. Barraycoa, J. «De Monarchia» de Dante: la frontera de la edad media y la modernidad. *Pensamiento Revista de Investigación E Información Filosófica*, 79(305), 1607-1618, 2024.
4. Bogataj, J. Inspired by Cicero: Ambrosian contribution to the formation of a clerical ethos in the de officiis. *Bogoslovni Vestnik*, 82(4), 2022.
5. Bergvall, Å. Between Eusebius and Augustine: una and the cult of elizabeth. *English Literary Renaissance*, 27(1), 3-30, 1997.
6. Bukier, A. Utopian literature of the ideal society: a study in al Farabi's virtuous city & more's utopia., 5, 2018.
7. Diana, R., Masruri, S., & Surwandono, S. Etika politik dalam perspektif al-mawardi. *Tsaqafah*, 14(2), 363, 2018.
8. Huriye Hümeýra Idriz, İslam düşüncesinde nasihatü'l-mülûk geleneği ve gazâli'nin nasihatü'l-mülûk'u, S - 61, Bursa, 2020.
9. James, M. John of Salisbury's polycraticus, *The Journal of Theological Studies*, os-XI(3), 467-468, 1910.
10. Jelahun, F., Wutun, M., & Sanga, A. Representation of political communication without morality perspective of modern philosopher niccolo machiavelli. *Jurnal Filsafat Indonesia*, 6(1), 98-105, 2023.
11. Nizâmülmülk, Siyâsetnâme, Çev. Mehmet Taha Ayar, İstanbul; Türkiye İş Bankası Yay., S – 4, 2018.
12. Sylvène Édouard, A Critical Companion to the 'Mirrors for Princes' Literature, Chapter 8 *Specula Principum* and the Wise Governor in the Renaissance, Brill, P: 227–259, 2022.
13. Tahir, Z. Examining the impact of religion on civilization: insights from ibn khaldun and arnold toynbee's theories. *dirosat*, 2(2), 106-123, 2024.